Provincial Background

Punjab is Pakistan’s most populous province, accounting for 56 percent of the country’s total population. Although it is rich in agricultural land and is the most progressive province, in terms of literacy rate and share of children, both males and females enrolled at the primary school. About 1 in 20 children aged 5–14 years are involved in child labor (5 percent), with significant variations across gender, areas of residence, districts and wealth index quintiles. About 5 percent of children in the Punjab aged between 2–9 years have at least one reported type of disability, with the most commonly cited being an inability to speak or be understood in words. About 7 percent of people over 15 years of age are unemployed, with 6 percent unemployed in rural areas and 8 percent in urban areas. Most unemployed adults are in the 15–24 age-group.1

Although rapidly urbanizing, Punjab’s rural areas have large landholdings with extremely asymmetric power relations amongst land owners and sharecroppers. According to estimates 48.4 percent of Punjab’s population is female, yet many girls particularly in Southern Punjab may not have access to schooling because of gender biases and high poverty levels.2 Disparities are greater in the rural areas in comparison to urban areas and factors such as poverty and unavailability of schools, and overall quality of education affect parent’s decision on sending their children, particularly young girls to schools. According to Lloyd, Mete & Grant “poor girls living in rural areas suffer a triple disadvantage, with their poverty and rural location compounding the gender-based disadvantage experienced by their better-off urban peers”3. Andrabi4 conducted a study using multivariate regression analysis and proposed that the enrolment probability for a girl in a village with a school is almost 18 percentage points higher than in a Project Support Unit without a school.

These differences become even more pronounced in the southern districts of Punjab, which are amongst the poorest in the province. In districts like Rajanpur, where the enrolments for girls are lowest in the province, many families believe in sending their daughters to Islamic madrassah (religious schools) where they can be taught by female teachers only. According to Hafeez (2004) a study conducted on six Universal Primary Education project districts including Rajanpur only two-fifths of fathers and more than one-half of mothers reported that they would approve of school-enrolment for their daughters even if teachers were male and from among parents who disapproved school enrolment of girls in the company of male teachers, the major barriers included ‘religion’, ‘conservatism’, ‘tradition’, and ‘gender-gap in communication’.5 Over two-thirds of the parents did not approve enrolment of girls without the provision of ‘toilet’, ‘boundary wall’, ‘water’, ‘class rooms’, and ‘the necessary furniture’. ‘Irregularity of teachers’ was also a discouraging factor towards school enrolment.

---

1 UNESCO, 2011, Policy Analysis of Education in Punjab Province
3 Rural girls in Pakistan: Constraints of policy and culture Cynthia Lloyd, Cem Mete, and Monica Grant
4 Andrabi 2003
5 Muhammad, Hafeez (2004), Communities Perceptions on Girls’ Education- Study of six UPE project districts
Participation Trends by Gender

According to data gathered by NEMIS 2010-2011, there are 103,288 educational institutions in Punjab, out of which 60,026 are classified as primary institutions, 82 percent of these primary institutions are in "urban" Punjab. There are 19,235,817 students enrolled in the aforementioned institutions with 54.5 percent male enrolment and 45.5 percent female enrolment.

Punjab has always ranked the highest in education indicators; its NER for both boys and girls at the primary, middle and higher secondary school levels has been consistently higher than the national average.

- According to the PSLM survey 2010/2011, Punjab has a NER of 70 percent at the primary level, 23 percent at the middle level and 25 percent at the matric Level. However, enrolments drop for boys and girls from primary to middle and matric level. The disparity is not as pronounced as Khyber Paktunkhwa or Balochistan, however, boys outnumber girls at all three levels and the trend is not the other way round in any of the cases (Figure 1).
- Net enrolment numbers are comparative to the gross enrolment numbers and both indicators reflect growth and progression especially at the matric level of education, where it can be seen there has been an increase in female enrolment in 2010. These figures can be misleading as deeper analysis reveals that there are greater disparities at the district level and in some of the cases there is also a change in trend for example in case of Rawalpindi the disparity has shifted...
While on the other hand there are districts where the gender gap is huge for the females at all the levels.

- The NER at the primary level shows a constant gender disparity during the last decade and for the last five years the trend had been quite consistent. (Figure 2) At the middle level there has been a major change in trend in 2008-2009 with disparity favoring girls; however the gap is smaller because of the fall in number of boys enrolled not major increase in girls enrollment in the system. While at the matric level data shows that in 2010-2011 boys enrolments have gone down and thus the disparity is favoring girls. (Figure 3 and 4)

---

Comment [A3]: In district Rawalpindi (public & private) enrollment share in percentage:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Middle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>50.6%</td>
<td>48.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>49.4%</td>
<td>51.75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above data shows that only at middle level gender disparity in favor of girls.

---

Fig 2. NER at the primary level in Punjab

Data Source: PSLM 2001-2011

---

Situation Analysis Gender Disparity in Primary and Middle Education – case studies of Khanewal and Rawalpindi districts UNICEF 2010

---
Rajanpur is one district in Southern Punjab that stands out primarily because of the disparities in male and female enrolment (Figure 5). The indicators for female enrolment are comparatively weaker, especially at the rural level. The NER for girls in Rajanpur is 53 percent at the primary level (age 6-10 years) a percent higher than males and drops to an abysmally low 6 percent at the middle school level, and 8 percent at the matric level. However, it still reflects an improvement at the primary level where NER has increased by 17 percent points. For males, the NER has dropped at the primary level by 11 percent points. It is such type of inter district disparities that need to be further focused upon. On the other end of the spectrum, larger

---

metropolises like Lahore, Sheikhupura etc present a better picture and raise the indicators for the province as a whole, while there are still pockets of exclusions where vulnerable population is denied access to basic rights of education.

**Fig 5. NER Trends in Rajanpur**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 14-15 years | Matric Level  | 10-12 years | Middle  | 6-10 years | Primary

Data Source: PSLM 2006/2008/2011

- Pakistan has had a tradition of single sex schooling that has proved to be quite challenging due to the unavailability of female teachers in many parts of rural Pakistan. The poor quality of government primary schools and the hidden costs for both parents and children of government school attendance due to pervasive corruption and discriminatory treatment, has resulted in many parents opting to send their children to private schools. According to NEMIS 2010, there are currently 85,828 public (70.8 percent) and private (29.2 percent) schools in Pakistan. (Figure 6)

- According to the NEMIS data in Punjab, private schools for girls outnumber the boy schools. It is interesting to note that the public investment in education for girls is lower in comparison to boys and schools for females are fewer in number particularly in the urban areas. Current enrolment in these schools is 13,406, 416 with 63 percent enrolled in public and 37 percent enrolled in private institutions in Punjab. Of the total private institutions 75.6 percent are co-educational as they are for profit organizations trying to maximize enrolments. The private sector is unregulated and thus raises further issues of quality of education and manipulation and

---

**Box 1. Promote in Bangladesh**

The Program to Motivate, Train and Employ Female Teachers in Rural Secondary Schools (PROMOTE) in Bangladesh (1995–2005) attracted female teachers to rural areas by providing hostel accommodation, expanded training facilities, and an incentive to enhance the appeal of the profession to women in rural Bangladesh. It provided provisions of safe housing for female teachers in rural areas and helping women find jobs in rural areas. This is one of the best known programs of female teacher recruitment, training, support and through this program significant increase in female enrolment in rural areas was observed. Female students are encouraged to study their Bachelors of Education, with emphasis on specializing in English, science and mathematics (Grontmij-Carlbro 2005).

**Comment [A4]:** In private sector Girls schools > boys schools 3306 > 2678 The above figures is in favor of statement

**Comment [A5]:** Public schools in Urban area Female schools > Male schools 3259 > 2903 It shows that data is contrary and needs further verification.

**Comment [A6]:** Current enrollment is 18633719 with 56.6% enrolled in public and 43.4% enrollment in private schools.

**Comment [A7]:** 86% schools are co-educational

---

* Rural girls in Pakistan: Constraints of policy and culture Cynthia Lloyd, Cem Mete, and Monica Grant
exploitation of teachers particularly females who often work without contracts and under adverse conditions. Public investments in the number of separate schools in rural areas come out as a major gap. With the majority of schools in the urban areas for males and females, the rural population is denied access to single-sex schools. In the more conservative and socio-economically marginalized districts of Southern Punjab like Rajanpur, Bhalwalpur, Dera Ghazi Khan etc., where parents prefer to send their daughters to separate schools where they are taught by female teachers, single-sex schools are required to increase girls' enrollment because parents' perceptions about mixed schooling can limit the decision of sending the girl child to school. This phenomenon becomes even more pronounced when the girls reach adolescence.

Data Source: NEMIS 2010-2011

Comment [A8]: As per PMIU's database, No. of public sector schools (Urban, Rural)
- Male: 2903, 26959
- Female: 3259, 24756

There is a variation in the number of schools so needs verification.

9 Muhammad, Hafeez (2004), Communities Perceptions on Girls' Education- Study of six UPE project districts
- Analysis of public versus private spending in Punjab reveals that the pattern is the same as earlier discussed in the other provinces (Figure 7 and 8). The private sector is playing a major role and filling in the gap for the public sector and the majority of the private schools (75.60 percent) are co-educational and located in urban areas. This highlights the demand for education for boys and girls in the urban areas of the province. The situation is slightly different in Southern Punjab where there is preference for separate schools for boys and girls. The recent rapid rise in private school enrollment at the primary level in rural Pakistan (Sathar and others...

Comment [A9]: Fig 7 shows incorrect data because we know that the no of schools in rural area is much more than no. of schools in urban area.
Data classification is not done in appropriate manner…. data is opposite entered against rural and urban.

Comment [A10]: The figures regarding private sector are contrary as per PMIU’s database

Data Source: NEMIS 2010-2011
2006; Andrabi, Das, and Khwaja 2002, 2006) suggests the possibility, however, that there may be a large reservoir of unmet demand for girls’ schooling in rural areas. According to Andrabi, Das & Khawaja (2010) data show that private schools arise precisely in those villages where there exists a pool of educated women, which in turn are far more common in areas where Government Girls’ secondary school exists. Due to a lack of outside opportunities, these women have lower wage rates than educated men and are exploited. These low wages are then passed onto the students in terms of low fees in the competitive market.

- **Overall, there are 616,053 teachers in Punjab with 48 percent in public institutions and 52 percent in private schools. The current teacher student ratio in the public sector is 1:28 and 1:14 in private institutions.** With the teaching force consisting of teachers in the urban and rural areas, approximately 60 percent of the teachers in Punjab are female and 40 percent male. 20.06 percent of the total workforce is in the rural areas, with 42.9 percent female teachers in the urban areas. (Figure 9)

- **Teacher absenteeism is another factor that has implications for girls and boys participation.** The problem is more prevalent in government schools. Using data collected in rural Punjab and NWFP in 1997, Lloyd, Mete, and Sathar (2005) find that a measure of the share of teachers residing in the community (a proxy of the extent of teacher absenteeism) is a statistically significant factor inhibiting girls’ enrollment but an unimportant factor for boys. Some of challenges faced by the female teachers are political postings and transfers and limitations on mobility. Jabeen, (2001) explain that “external factors as well as internal factors affect the performance of female teachers and thus can have implications for student participation. External factors include are lack of gender justice, gender disparities/threats, posting at distant from their own houses, transport problem, political instability and undue political interference”.

**Box 2. Best practice - Mexico**

PROGRESA [Programme for Education, Health and Nutrition] was initiated by the Government of Mexico in 1992, and scaled up in rural areas in 1997, with the aim of breaking the cycle of poverty among rural households and improving educational standards. The program consisted of conditional cash transfer programme to poor household with children: supporting household consumption, and child transfers tailored on school grade and sex; food supplements for infants undernourished; institutional and financial support for education and health providers. It was conditional on children attending school, and all household members accessing primary health care. In 1999 monthly benefits started at 80 pesos in grade 3 of primary school and increased with each grade. The method was selected in order to retain enrolment past the primary level of education and decrease the drop out rate and out of school children. In secondary schooling, benefits are higher for females with the aim of reducing gender gaps in educational outcomes. Progresa works closely with the Ministry of Education to ensure that extra schools, teachers and supplies are available in areas that have low enrollment so student teacher ratios remain consistent. Results also indicate that because schools have been built in program areas, the distances to secondary schools have reduced by 100 percent.

Government Programs in Punjab

Punjab has a long history of effective government programs as a result of which it is the most progressive province for child enrolment. A noteworthy mention is that of the Punjab Education Sector Reforms Program, launched in 2003 had the objective of improving access to schooling, quality of education and ensuring governance in the education sector. (World Bank). The program addressed supply side constraints and upgraded schools and filled teacher vacancies. On the demand-side, measures were taken to offer stipends for girls, provision of free textbooks and an initiative was taken to provide subsidies to low-fee private schools. (Malik, 2011). The results were encouraging as net primary enrolment increased from 45 to 62 percent between 2001 an 2007 and female primary net enrolment in the same period increased from 42 to 59 percent. Rural net female enrolment in particular grew from 38 to 55 percent. Primary completion rates in public schools increased from 58 percent to 61 percent. One thousand previously closed schools were made functional again and over 30,000 schools had toilets, boundary walls and additional classrooms added. 28.6 million free textbooks were distributed in 2008-2009 amongst students in grades 1-10. 350,000 eligible girls received a monthly stipend of 200 rupees based on attendance, and this conditional cash transfer led to an increase in enrolment (Chaudary 2010). In the PESRP programme document, it notes that: (a) female middle school enrolment rate increased from 43% (baseline 2003) to 53% in 2005, (b) share of female enrolment in government primary and middle school increased from 45% in 2003 to 50% in 2005 and (c) female dropout rates between grade 5 and 6 decreased by 25%, and that in middle school decreased by 20%.

The Government of Punjab also set up Punjab Examination Commission (PEC) to evaluate learning outcomes at the Primary and Elementary Education levels. PEC tabulates results school wise and subject wise and is compulsory for students of grade 5 and 8, in both private and public schools to appear in these examinations. The feedback helps the department of education to realign the policy, supply –side inputs and carryout the needed adjustments to improve learning outcomes (Malik, 2011).

---

Fig 9. Teachers by Gender and Location in Punjab

- Urban Male: 26.84%
- Urban Female: 10.14%
- Rural Male: 20.06%
- Rural Female: 42.96%

Data source: NEMIS 2010-2011

The Government of Punjab is committed to make serious and strenuous efforts to improve access, quality, equity and governance in education sector by enhancing education facilities within the minimum possible time. The Punjab School Roadmap is an initiative taken that aims at 100% enrolment, retention and literacy. Although this program is not free of critics, interim reports submitted by EDOs, and evaluated by DMOs show 100% enrolment in 60% of the districts at the primary level (Malik, 2011).

**Box 3. Cambodia Scholarship Program**

The Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction Scholarship Program has had a positive effect on girls’ enrollment and attendance at secondary school in Cambio. Families receive conditional cash transfers on the condition that they enroll their children in school, maintain passing grades and are absent fewer than 10 days in a year. The success of this program has been repeated in many other forms across the world in developing countries. (Filmer and Schady 2006).
References


Policy Brief December 2010


Lloyd, C. B., C. Mete, and M. Grant. “Rural girls in Pakistan: Constraints of policy and culture ”

Muhammad, Hafeez (2004), Communities Perceptions on Girls’ Education- Study of six UPE project districts, UNICEF


Situation Analysis gender Disparity in primary and middle education – case studies of Khanewal and Rawalpindi districts UNICEF 2010


Rural girls in Pakistan: Constraints of policy and culture Cynthia Lloyd, Cem Mete, and Monica Grant

*Rural girls in Pakistan: Constraints of policy and culture Cynthia Lloyd, Cem Mete, and Monica Grant*

Andrab 2003

Muhammad, Hafeez (2004), Communities Perceptions on Girls’ Education- Study of six UPE project districts